The Kosterlitz-Thouless transition explored with atomic gases

Solvay chair for Physics 2022

Jean Dalibard

Lecture 2

This Solvay lecture series

Lecture 1 (inaugural), September 6: A brief history of cold atoms

Lecture 2, September 20 (2:00 pm): From Bose-Einstein condensation to Kosterlitz-Thouless physics

Lecture 3, September 23 (1:00 pm): Controlling atomic interactions: Scale invariance tested in the laboratory

Lecture 4, September 28 (2:00 pm): A droplet of spin-1 atoms: the simplest many-body system

Peierls, 1933: Physics in a low dimensional world

Would the usual physical objects like crystals or magnets exist in a 2D world?

At non-zero temperature there is no true crystalline order in dimension 1 or 2



 $\langle (\boldsymbol{u_j}) \rangle$

Generalization by Mermin-Wagner and Hohenberg (1966) for any system with short-range interactions: no breaking of a continuous symmetry leading to a long-range order in the system ($T \neq 0$)

This result also applies to the case of Bose-Einstein condensation (U(1) symmetry)



3

$$(- \boldsymbol{u}_0)^2
angle \propto T \, \ln(R_j)$$

diverges at long distance

Topological order





J.M. Kosterlitz

In spite of Mermin-Wagner-Hohenberg theorem, "unconventional" phase transitions can still take place in 2D systems

Transition between two different kinds of disordered phases, that are topologically distinct

1973, Kosterlitz & Thouless (prelim: Berezinskii): Ordering, metastability and phase transitions in two-dimensional sy

D.J. Thouless



F.D. Haldane



Outline of this lecture

- 1. The Peierls argument
- 2. The ideal 2D Bose gas
- 3. The Gross-Pitaevskii approach for the interacting 2D gas
- 4. The Kosterlitz- Thouless argument
- 5. Investigations with atomic, molecular and optical (AMO) systems

Hadzibabic & Dalibard, Riv. Nuo. Cim. 34, 389 + College de France lectures 2016-17 For superconductors: Benfatto, Castellani & Giamarchi, arXiv 1201.2307

The Peierls argument in 1D, 2D, 3D

1.



Simple argument in 1D: Piling up defects



Zero temperature + no quantum fluct.: ordered chain

Non-zero temperature:

We fix the position x_0 of the atom j = 0. The position of atom j = 1 can fluctuate:

$$x_1 = x_0 + a + \delta_1 \qquad \langle \delta_1 \rangle = 0$$

Then:
$$x_2 = x_1 + a + \delta_2$$

 \vdots
 $x_j = x_{j-1} + a + \delta_j$ $\langle \delta_j^2 \rangle \sim \frac{k_{\rm B}T}{\kappa}$



$$\longrightarrow x_j = x_0 + ja + \Delta_j \qquad \Delta_j = \delta_1 + \delta_2 + \dots$$

Sum of independent variables: $\langle \Delta_j^2 \rangle \sim \frac{k_{\rm B}T}{\kappa} j.$



Piling up defect (2)



If $\langle \Delta_j^2 \rangle \gtrsim a^2$, i.e. $j \gtrsim \frac{\kappa a^2}{k_{\rm p}T}$, all information is lost regarding the position of atom j with respect to the crystal period

For a more rigorous argument, look at the collective modes of the chains (phonons):



Average at thermal equilibrium: $\langle \tilde{u}_q \tilde{u}_{a'}^* \rangle = 0$

$$x_j = x_0 + ja + \Delta_j$$
 $\langle \Delta_j^2 \rangle \sim \frac{k_{\rm B}T}{\kappa} j.$

no long-range order

$$=\frac{1}{\sqrt{N}}\sum_{q}e^{iqX_{j}}\tilde{u}_{q} \qquad X_{j}=ja \qquad E=\sum_{q}\frac{1}{2}m\dot{\tilde{u}}_{q}\dot{\tilde{u}}_{-q}+\frac{1}{2}m\omega_{q}^{2}\dot{\tilde{u}}_{-q}$$

Collection of independent harmonic oscillators of wave vector q and frequency $\omega_q = 2\sqrt{\frac{\kappa}{m}} \sin(qa/2)$

if
$$q \neq q'$$
 and $\frac{1}{2}m\omega_q \langle |\tilde{u}_q|^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{2}k_{\rm B}T$





The 2D case



Logarithmic divergence of $\langle (\mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{r}_0 - \mathbf{j}a)^2 \rangle$ with the distance ja with a dominant contribution of $q \sim \pi/ja$



The detailed analysis is more complicated because of the two possible polarizations of the modes: parallel or perpendicular to q

Scaling analysis: phonons $q = (q_x, q_y)$ with $\omega_q = cq$ for low q

$$\frac{1}{2}m\omega_q \langle |\tilde{u}_q|^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{2}k_{\rm B}T$$

$$\mathbf{r}_{j} - \mathbf{r}_{0} - \mathbf{j}a = \frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \sum_{\mathbf{q}} \left(e^{iqja} - 1 \right) \mathbf{\tilde{u}}_{q}$$

"Only logarithmic" in 2D: quasi-long range order





The 3D case



One then finds that $\langle (\mathbf{r}_j - \mathbf{r}_0 - \mathbf{j}a)^2 \rangle$ is independent of j

Cristalline order can exist over an infinite range

Same type of analysis:

$$|\mathbf{u}_{j} - \mathbf{u}_{0}|^{2} \rangle \sim \frac{ak_{\mathrm{B}}T}{\kappa} \int_{\mathrm{ZB}} \frac{\sin^{2}(\mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{R}_{j}/2)}{q^{2}} \mathrm{d}^{3}q$$

= $a^{2} \mathrm{d}a \mathrm{d}^{2}\Omega \longrightarrow$ no divergence anymore

$$q^2 dq d^2 \Omega \longrightarrow$$
 no divergence anymore
in $q = 0$





For a system with a dimension lower or equal to 2 and short-range interactions, there is no spontaneous breaking of a continuous symmetry at a non-zero temperature

- If the range is infinite, mean-field theory is valid and standard phase transitions predicted in this case can occur.
- Continuous symmetry: translation, Heisenberg magnetism, Bose-Einstein

• At zero temperature the interacting Bose gas is condensed.

condensation. The theorem does not apply as such to discrete symmetries (Ising).

What about graphene?

Compatibility with Mermin - Wagner - Hohenberg theorem?

A finite size sample may exhibit a crystalline order

parallel to the surface induce an effective long-range component



• Because of the slow increase of log(j) with j, the loss of crystal order appears only on very long length scales

• The surface is rippled and the non-linear coupling between the fluctuations of the height and the displacements

Fasolino et al, 2007 Nature materials 6.11, p. 858–861.

2.

The 2D ideal Bose gas

Bose particles confined in a box at fixed temperature

The number of particles that can be placed in the excited sates is bounded. Indeed the Bose law

$$N_{p} = \frac{1}{e^{(E_{p} - \mu)/k_{\rm B}T} - 1}$$

is meaningful only if $\ \mu < E_0 = 0$

$$N_{\rm exc}(T,\mu) = \sum_{p \neq 0} \frac{1}{e^{(E_p - \mu)/k_{\rm B}T} - 1}$$

Continuum limit using the density of states: $N_{
m exc}($

Does this integral converge in E=0 ?



$$(T,\mu) < \int_{0}^{+\infty} \frac{D(E)}{e^{E/k_{\rm B}T} - 1} dE$$

Einstein's saturated ideal gas (2)

$$N_{\rm exc}(T,\mu) < \int_0^{+\infty} \frac{D(E)}{e^{E/k_{\rm B}T} - 1} \, \mathrm{d}E$$

The convergence in E = 0 depends on D(E)

• In 3D: $D(E) \propto \sqrt{E}$ and $\frac{1}{e^{E/k_{\rm B}T}}$ $\longrightarrow k_{\rm B}T \int_{0}^{\cdot} \frac{1}{\sqrt{E}} dE$ converges in E = 0 : BEC !

• In 2D: D(E) is constant and the integral $k_{\rm B}T \int_0^{\cdot} \frac{1}{E} \, \mathrm{d}E$ diverges

For a given T, one can put an arbitrarily large number of particles in the excited states by letting $\mu \to 0$: no BEC



$$\frac{1}{-1} \approx \frac{1}{\left(1 + \frac{E}{k_{\rm B}T}\right) - 1} = \frac{k_{\rm B}T}{E}$$



Momentum distribution of the ideal 2D Bose gas

Quantum statistics still play a role, even in the absence of condensation: Particles accumulate in the region of small momenta

Varying phase space density from $\ll 1$ to $\gg 1$



$$N(\mathbf{p}) = \frac{1}{e^{(p^2/2m - \mu)/k_{\rm B}T} - 1} \,\hat{}$$

$$\lambda_T = \frac{\hbar\sqrt{2\pi}}{\sqrt{mk_{\rm B}T}}$$
$$\mathcal{D} = \rho\lambda_T^2$$

: thermal wavelength

$$\frac{p\lambda_T}{\hbar} = 1 \iff \frac{p^2}{2m} = \frac{1}{4\pi}k_{\rm B}T$$

$$\approx \frac{k_{\rm B}T}{\frac{p^2}{2m} + |\mu|}$$

Lorentz distribution



1	/
- I.	6
	U

Spatial coherence of the ideal 2D Bose gas

Characterized by the one-body correlation function

$$G_1(m{r},m{r}')=\langlem{r}|\hat
ho_1|m{r}'
angle$$
 :Fou



An exponential decay is by essence "fast" (even if ℓ can be large): no emergence of quasi-long range order at this stage...

irier transform of the momentum distribution

Lorentz momentum distribution

Exponential G_1

 $G_1(r,0) \propto \mathrm{e}^{-r/\ell}$

The coherence length ℓ increases with \mathscr{D}



The Gross-Pitaevskii approach for the interacting 2D gas



3.

Contact interactions described by the 3D scattering length *a*

The 2D Gross-Pitaevskii energy

Description of the state of the gas by the classical field $\psi(x, y) : E = E_{kin} + E_{int}$

$$E_{\rm kin} = \frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \int |\nabla \psi|^2 \, \mathrm{d}^2 r$$
$$E_{\rm int} = \frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \, \tilde{g} \, \int |\psi(\mathbf{r})|^4 \, \mathrm{d}^2 r$$

 $\psi(\mathbf{r}) = \sqrt{\rho_0}$ Ground state in a box $L \times L$:

At non-zero temperature, phase and density fluctuations:

Freezing of density fluctuations due to repulsive atomic interactions, $\psi(\boldsymbol{r}) = \sqrt{\rho(\boldsymbol{r})} e^{i\theta(\boldsymbol{r})}$ valid for large phase space densities

 $\mathscr{D} \gg 1$

The interaction energy is a constant: only the kinetic energy is relevant for the dynamics

$$\tilde{g} = \sqrt{8\pi} \frac{a}{a_{\rm ho}}$$

Dimensionless parameter describing the strength of contact interactions

$$\rho_0 = \frac{N}{L^2}$$

$$\psi(\boldsymbol{r}) \approx \sqrt{\rho_0} e^{i\theta(\boldsymbol{r})}$$

$$\mathscr{D} = \rho_0 \lambda_T^2 \qquad \qquad \lambda_T^2 = \frac{2\pi\hbar^2}{mk_B T}$$

Phase coherence in an interacting 2D Bose gas

$$E_{\rm kin} = \frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \int |\boldsymbol{\nabla}\psi|^2 \, \mathrm{d}^2 r \qquad -$$

Fourier expansion of the phase $\theta(\mathbf{r}) = \sum_{\mathbf{q}} c_{\mathbf{q}} e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot\mathbf{r}}$ At thermal equilibrium: $\langle |c_{m{q}}|^2
angle \propto k_{
m B} T$

One-body correlation function $G_1(r) = \langle \psi(r) \rangle$



 $\psi(\boldsymbol{r}) \approx \sqrt{\rho_0} e^{i\theta(\boldsymbol{r})}$

 $\mathcal{D} = 10$

 r/λ_T

300









A uniform 2D gas in the lab

Frozen motion along the vertical direction z

 $\omega_z/2\pi = 4 \,\mathrm{kHz}$

Initial confinement in the xy plane:

Box-like potential with arbitrary shape



density up to 100 atoms/µm²

Uniform gas with $\sim 10^5$ atoms

PhDs: R. Saint-Jalm, E. Le Cerf, B. Bakkali-Hassani, J.-L. Ville, C. Maury, G. Chauveau Postdocs: M. Aidelsburger, P.C.M. Castilho, Y.-Q. Zhou Pls: S. Nascimbene, J. Beugnon, J. Dalibard





Accessing the correlation function $G_1(r, r')$

Investigation via a "Young slit" experiment





A game changer: vortices



If an isolated vortex has a significant probability to appear in the vicinity of the AB segment, the relative phase will strongly fluctuate:

$$\phi \rightarrow \phi + \pi$$

If isolated vortices have a spatial density ρ_v , one can expect that any phase ordering will be lost over a distance $\sim \rho_v^{-1/2}$

Consider two points A and B between which there exists a significant phase coherence if one restricts to phonon excitations



The Kosterlitz-Thouless transition explored with atomic gases

Solvay chair for Physics 2022

Lecture 2, part 2

Jean Dalibard

The Kosterlitz- Thouless argument

4.

Velocity field of a vortex

Example of a vortex in r = 0: $\psi(r) = \sqrt{\rho(r)} e^{i\varphi}$

$$oldsymbol{v}(oldsymbol{r}) = rac{\hbar}{m}oldsymbol{
abla} heta = rac{\hbar}{mr}oldsymbol{u}_arphi$$







 \tilde{g} : Dimensionless interaction parameter \propto 3D scatt. length / thickness

Kinetic energy (vortex at the center of a disk of radius R):

$$E_{\rm kin} = \frac{1}{2} m \int \rho(r) v^2(r) \, \mathrm{d}^2 r \qquad v(r) = \frac{\hbar}{mr}$$
$$\approx \frac{1}{2} m \rho \frac{\hbar^2}{m^2} \int_{\xi}^{R} \frac{1}{r^2} r \, \mathrm{d} r$$
$$= \pi \frac{\hbar^2 \rho}{m} \ln(R/\xi) \qquad \text{Prefactor : robust}$$
Inside the log : depe

Diverges with system size

Interaction energy: one must create a hole of size ξ in the fluid



ends on the model for the core

 $\epsilon_0 \sim \frac{\hbar^2 \rho}{m} \ll E_{\rm kin}$

Is the existence of an isolated vortex likely?



 $E_{\rm kin}$ $\overline{k_{\rm B}T}$

Probability for a giver

Total probability: $\mathcal{P} = Wp \approx \left(\frac{\xi}{R}\right)^{-2+\nu/2}$ energetic term entropic term



$$\mathcal{D} = \rho \lambda_T^2 \qquad \qquad \lambda_T^2$$

Number of independent « boxes » to place the vortex: $W = R^2 / \xi^2$

Probability for a vortex to exist in such a box: $p \approx e^{-E_{kin}/k_BT}$

$$= \frac{1}{k_{\rm B}T} \frac{\pi \hbar^2 \rho}{m} \ln(R/\xi) = \frac{\mathcal{D}}{2} \ln(R/\xi)$$

h box: $p \approx \exp\left[-\frac{\mathcal{D}}{2}\log\left(\frac{R}{\xi}\right)\right] = \left(\frac{\xi}{R}\right)^{\mathcal{D}/2}$

Renormalization:

$$\rho, \mathcal{D} \longrightarrow \rho_s, \mathcal{D}_s$$

superfluid component



Temperature Proliferation of isolated vortices, loss of quasi-long range order



What about vortex pairs?

Superposition of the velocity fields created by each vortex



Dipolar field: Decreases as $1/r^2$ at infinity instead of 1/rfor an isolated vortex

Finite energy even for an infinite sample: always present at non-zero temperature







Magnetic analogy: Field created by parallel wires with opposite currents





Vortices and superfluidity

Current in a ring, corresponding to a phase winding $2\pi N$ of the field $\psi(\mathbf{r})$

Is this current metastable ?

If isolated vortices exist in the ring, they may cross it:



 $N \to N \pm 1$

Fluctuations of the current, which will thus be damped and will tend to zero

Isolated vortices destroy the superfluidity



A pair of vortices of opposite charges has no effect on the current



Vortex pairs do not destroy the superfluidity



To summarize



 \tilde{g} : Dimensionless interaction parameter

Prokofev and Svistunov

First experimental evidences

Superfluidity of liquid helium films



Also 2D superconducting films, colloidal particles, arrays of tunnel junctions,...

What about atomic, molecular and optical (AMO) systems?







Investigation with AMO systems

Observation of vortices

Superfluidity

Sound and superfluid jump

4.

provith with poperture dependent dealing days seating the poperty of a the tw haqualitative contractive to the property of the bassover r the xponent of and a second field the creater of th the signals grate at the entited with the attended and the entited with the state of the entities of the entits of the entits of the entities of the entities of the entities gas lines)lines) [31] A sponent which increases with temperature in **bëf** our desiverentes at statistic by The subject and Material $\psi_a(x,y)$ of the first 24. To function $\psi_b(x,y)$ provides the set of kall partific intersets the cost spin is the only comean and the ng centra the line of the state sureduiechtigen cheinfareinterenetipteinpeinpeinpeinpeintereneista, suffi, sop by character and the second of for Material and the second of ityant permission and the second state of the second secon ngterarie



Investigation with AMO systems

Observation of vortices

Superfluidity

Sound and superfluid jump

4.

Testing superfluidity with a Rb atomic gas



Does a moving impurity "heat" the sample?

Impurity: focused laser beam that repels the atoms

For given μ , T, we stir for 200 ms and measure the slight increase of temperature

Desbuquois et al., Nature Physics 8 645 (2012)

Related experiment in Seoul (2015, Yong-II Shin's group)





The critical velocity in 2D

Critical velocity measured for various μ , T



Critical μ/k_BT in excellent agreement with classical field simulations (Mathey's team)

Desbuquois et al., Nature Physics 8 645 (2012)



Vijay Pal Singh et al., Phys. Rev. A 95, 043631 (2017)



Testing superfluidity with boson molecules

Hamburg 2015 (Moritz's group): strongly interacting 6Li2



Here also excellent agreement with classical field simulations (Mathey's team)

Superfluidity of polariton fluids

Hybrid objects in 2D, partly photon, partly exciton (electron-hole pair in a quantum well)



Quasi-condensation



Kasprzak et al., Nature 443 409 (2006)

- Very low effective mass
- Interactions due to the exciton part

Flow around a static defect



30 μm

low dens: 1 µm⁻²

large dens: 40 μm⁻²

Amo et al., Nat. Phys. 5 805 (2009)



Investigation with AMO systems

Observation of vortices

Superfluidity

Sound and superfluid jump

4.

Propagation of sound waves in a 2D gas



Modulation of the atomic density for a short period (20 ms) on one edge

Density modulation right after the excitation

J.-L. Ville et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 121, 145301 (2018)



Multiple bounces of the wave packet Sound velocity 2mm/s



J.-L. Ville et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 121, 145301 (2018)

⁸⁷Rb, $\tilde{g} = 0.15$

Line: prediction by Ozawa and Stringari, based on the equation of state calculated by Prokofev and Svistunov





The two-fluid model (both 3D and 2D)

The essence of the model: superfluid + normal components

 $\rho = \rho_s + \rho_n$ Total density

 $\boldsymbol{j} =
ho_s \boldsymbol{v}_s +
ho_n \boldsymbol{v}_n$ Total current

- The entropy of the fluid is attributed entirely to the normal fluid

Propagation of a weak perturbation with a low frequency ω

- Superfluid hydrodynamics: $\omega \ll \mu/\hbar$ (i.e., wavelength >> healing length)
- Normal hydrodynamics: $\omega \ll \Gamma_{coll}$ (i.e., wavelength >> mean free path)

Leads to two wave equations: $\overline{\partial t^2}$

P: pressure

Bi-square equation for the speed of sound: $c^4 - \alpha c^2 + \beta = 0$ with α, β functions of ρ_s / ρ_n



• The superfluid flow is irrotational, except for quantized vortices (which are not relevant for sound waves)

Two types of sound waves

 \tilde{s} : entropy/unit mass





Observation of the two sounds

Cambridge : Hadzibabic group (Nature, 2021)

³⁹K, $\tilde{g} = 0.64$







Summary

From Peierls to Berezinskii - Kosterlitz - Thouless



R. Peierls 1907-95

No breaking of a continuous symmetry in a 2D system at $T \neq 0$

BKT : A non conventional phase transition is still possible

Superfluid transition



VADIM L'VOVICH BEREZINSKIĬ (1935 - 1980)



J.M. Kosterlitz



D.J. Thouless



The role of AMO systems

Quantum fluids with atoms, molecules, photons, polaritons, have provided a unique insight in several aspects of BKT physics

- Superfluid behavior and critical point
- Visualisation of vortices
- Sound propagation
- Evidence for algebraic decay: $G_1(r) \propto r^{-\alpha}$ $\alpha \approx 1/4$ at the critical point (Oxford 2022)

Current and future developments

- Influence of disorder
- Dynamics across the phase transition: revisiting the Kibble-Zurek mechanism



